

DECISION AND STATEMENT OF REASONS OF PETRA HENNIG MCFATRIDGE LEGAL MEMBER OF THE FIRST-TIER TRIBUNAL WITH DELEGATED POWERS OF THE CHAMBER PRESIDENT

Under Rule 8 of the First-tier Tribunal for Scotland Housing and Property Chamber Rules of Procedure 2017 ("the Procedural Rules")

in connection with

23 St Catherines Road Perth PH1 5SA

Case Reference: FTS/HPC/EV/19/2154

Amer Choudrey ("the Applicant")

Tommy Ellison ("the Respondent")

1. On 10 July 2019 an application was received from the Applicant. The application was made under Rule 109 of the Procedural Rules being an application for an eviction order under S 51 of the Private Housing (Tenancies) (Scotland) Act 2016 (the Act). The following documents were lodged with the Tribunal for the application:-

S 11 Notice to Local Authority, Notice to Leave, Rent Statement, Agent's Rent Statement, Death Certificate

The documents are referred to for their terms and held to be incorporated herein.

The Tribunal had requested proof of service of the Notice to Leave and on 18 July

2019 the Applicant submitted an email to the Respondent dated 17 May 2019 which stated "We attach a Notice to Leave". This was sent by email on 17 May 2019 at 14:15 hours.

DECISION

2. I considered the application in terms of Rule 8 of the Procedural Rules. That Rule provides:-

"Rejection of application

- 8.—(1) The Chamber President or another member of the First-tier Tribunal under the delegated powers of the Chamber President, must reject an application if –
- (a) they consider that the application is frivolous or vexatious;
- (b) the dispute to which the application relates has been resolved;
- (c) they have good reason to believe that it would not be appropriate to accept the application;
- (d) they consider that the application is being made for a purpose other than a purpose specified in the application; or
- (e) the applicant has previously made an identical or substantially similar application and in the opinion of the Chamber President or another member of the First-tier Tribunal, under the delegated powers of the Chamber President, there has been no significant change in any material considerations since the identical or substantially similar application was determined.
- (2) Where the Chamber President, or another member of the First-tier Tribunal, under the delegated powers of the Chamber President, makes a decision under paragraph (1) to reject an application the First-tier Tribunal must notify the applicant and the notification must state the reason for the decision."

3. After consideration of the application, the attachments and correspondence from the Applicant, I consider that the application should be rejected on the basis that the application is frivolous or vexatious within the meaning of Rule 8(1)(a) of the Procedural Rules.

REASONS FOR DECISION

Legislation:

S 62 of the Private Housing (Tenancies) (Scotland) Act 2016 states:

62Meaning of notice to leave and stated eviction ground

This section has no associated Explanatory Notes

(1) References in this Part to a notice to leave are to a notice which—

(a)is in writing,

(b)specifies the day on which the landlord under the tenancy in question expects to become entitled to make an application for an eviction order to the First-tier Tribunal,

(c)states the eviction ground, or grounds, on the basis of which the landlord proposes to seek an eviction order in the event that the tenant does not vacate the let property before the end of the day specified in accordance with paragraph (b), and

(d)fulfils any other requirements prescribed by the Scottish Ministers in regulations.

(2)In a case where two or more persons jointly are the landlord under a tenancy, references in this Part to the tenant receiving a notice to leave from the landlord are to the tenant receiving one from any of those persons.

(3)References in this Part to the eviction ground, or grounds, stated in a notice to leave are to the ground, or grounds, stated in it in accordance with subsection (1)(c).

(4) The day to be specified in accordance with subsection (1)(b) is the day falling after the day on which the notice period defined in section 54(2) will expire.

(5) For the purpose of subsection (4), it is to be assumed that the tenant will receive the notice to leave 48 hours after it is sent.

S 54 (1),(2) and (4) of the said Act states:

54Restriction on applying during the notice period

(1)A landlord may not make an application to the First-tier Tribunal for an eviction order against a tenant using a copy of a notice to leave until the expiry of the relevant period in relation to that notice.

(2) The relevant period in relation to a notice to leave-

- (a)begins on the day the tenant receives the notice to leave from the landlord, and
- (b) expires on the day falling-
- (i)28 days after it begins if subsection (3) applies,
- (ii)84 days after it begins if subsection (3) does not apply.
- (4) The reference in subsection (1) to using a copy of a notice to leave in making an application means using it to satisfy the requirement under section 52(3).
- S 52 of the Act states:

52Applications for eviction orders and consideration of them

- (1)In a case where two or more persons jointly are the landlord under a tenancy, an application for an eviction order may be made by any one of those persons.
- (2) The Tribunal is not to entertain an application for an eviction order if it is made in breach of—
- (a) subsection (3), or
- (b)any of sections 54 to 56 (but see subsection (4)).
- (3)An application for an eviction order against a tenant must be accompanied by a copy of a notice to leave which has been given to the tenant.
- (4)Despite subsection (2)(b), the Tribunal may entertain an application made in breach of section 54 if the Tribunal considers that it is reasonable to do so.
- (5)The Tribunal may not consider whether an eviction ground applies unless it is a ground which—
- (a)is stated in the notice to leave accompanying the landlord's application in accordance with subsection (3), or
- (b)has been included with the Tribunal's permission in the landlord's application as a stated basis on which an eviction order is sought.
 - 4. The Tribunal has considered whether or not the application must be rejected as frivolous within the meaning of Rule 8(1)(a) of the Procedural Rules. 'Frivolous' in the context of legal proceedings is defined by Lord Justice Bingham in *R v North West Suffolk (Mildenhall) Magistrates Court,* (1998) Env. L.R. 9. At page 16, he states: "What the expression means in this context is, in my view, that the court considers the application to be futile, misconceived, hopeless or academic". It is that definition which I have to consider in this application in order to determine whether or not this application is frivolous, misconceived, and has no prospect of success.

- 5. The Application relies on the service of the Notice to Leave having been carried out by email sent to the Respondent on 17 May 2019 at 14:15 hours. .
- 6. In terms of S 52 (3) of the Act an application must be accompanied by a copy of the Notice to Leave. I consider that this means that a valid Notice to Leave must be submitted with the application. The issue here is whether or not the Notice to Leave was a valid Notice to Leave and thus fulfills the requirement of S 52 (3) of the Act.
- 7. In terms of the email to the Respondent of 17 May 2019 supplied in evidence, the Notice to Leave was sent on 17 May 2019 at 14:15 hours 2019.
- 8. The expiry of the period stated in S 54 (2) (b) (i) of the Act will be 28 days after the period begins. In terms of S 62 (5) of the Act "for the purpose of subsection (4), it is to be assumed that the tenant will receive the notice to leave 48 hours after it is sent." In terms of S 62 (4) of the Act "The day to be specified in accordance with subsection (1)(b) is the day falling after the day on which the notice period defined in section 54(2) will expire."
- 9. In terms of S 62 (5) of the Act the Notice to Leave sent by email on 17 May 2019 is deemed to have reached the Respondent 48 hours later and thus on 19 May 2019. The 28 day period stated in S 54 (2) of the Act thus has to be determined on the basis that the Notice to Leave was received on 19 May 2019. The date 28 days after 19 May 2019 is 16 June 2019. Therefor the 28 day period would expire on 16 June 2019 and thus the earliest date for making the application in terms of S 62 (1) (b) and (4) of the Act is 17 June 2019, which would be the date which has to be stated in the Notice to Leave under Part 4. However, the Notice to Leave states as the relevant date 15 June 2019 rather than 17 June 2019. I thus consider that the information in the Notice to Leave is incorrect and the notice not valid as it does not specify the correct date in terms of S 62 (4) of the Act. If the Notice to Leave is invalid because the wrong date is stated I consider that the application cannot be successful.
- 10. Accordingly, for these reasons, this application is rejected upon the basis that the application is frivolous within the meaning of Rule 8(1)(a) of the Procedural Rules.

What you should do now

If you accept the Legal Member's decision, there is no need to reply. If you disagree with this decision:-

An applicant aggrieved by the decision of the Chamber President, or any Legal Member acting under delegated powers, may appeal to the Upper Tribunal for Scotland on a point of law only. Before an appeal can be made to the Upper Tribunal, the party must first seek permission to appeal from the First-tier Tribunal. That party must seek permission to appeal within 30 days of the date the decision was sent to them. Information about the appeal procedure can be forwarded to you on request.

Petra Hennig-McFatridge

Petra Hennig McFatridge Legal Member 5 August 2019